# 8-County <br> Compensation Study May 2013 <br> Commissioned by: <br> Highland County <br> Community Action Organization 



## Table of Contents

## Page

Introduction ..... 2
Executive Summary ..... 5
Methodology ..... 13
Survey Results ..... 16
Appendix ..... 45
Ohio Map of Unemployment Rates ..... 46
Map of Survey Area ..... 47
8-County Compensation Survey ..... 48

This compensation study was conducted by:
Nancy Bowen-Ellzey OSU Extension Field Specialist Community Economies bowen-ellzey.1@osu.edu

Rose Fisher Merkowitz OSU Extension Educator Community Development merkowitz.1@osu.edu

Becky Nesbitt OSU Extension Educator Community Development nesbitt.21@osu.edu

The Ohio State University


## Introduction

The 8-County Compensation Study provides valuable information about employee wages and benefits for businesses and organizations in Adams, Brown, Clinton, Fayette, Highland, Pickaway, Pike and Ross counties. Since the downturn in the economy in 2008, businesses and organizations have struggled to thrive financially. An important strategy for sustainability includes maintaining competitive salaries and benefits to attract and retain good employees. The findings in this study will help decision-makers and organization leaders compare the salary and benefit structure of their organization with similar organizations in the geographic area.

## Background Information

## Population by County

| County | Population |
| :---: | :---: |
| Adams | 28,550 |
| Brown | 44,846 |
| Clinton | 42,040 |
| Fayette | 29,030 |
| Highland | 43,589 |
| Pickaway | 55,698 |
| Pike | 28,709 |
| Ross | 78,064 |

United State Census Bureau (2010) http://quickfacts.census.gov/qfd/states/39/39001.html

## Unemployment Rates

The eight counties studied have among the highest rates of unemployment in Ohio. The chart below lists the unemployment rates as of March 2013. See the Appendix for a map of Ohio with each the county's unemployment rates listed.

| State of Ohio | $\mathbf{7 . 3 \%}$ |
| :---: | :---: |
| Adams | $12.0 \%$ |
| Brown | $10.0 \%$ |
| Clinton | $10.2 \%$ |
| Fayette | $7.2 \%$ |
| Highland | $9.8 \%$ |
| Pickaway | $7.9 \%$ |
| Pike | $13.4 \%$ |
| Ross | $8.6 \%$ |

Ohio Department of Jobs and Family Services (3/13) http://ohiolmi.com/laus/ColorRateMap.pdf

The information contained in this report will allow leaders within organizations, businesses, and local government, to better understand the compensation packages available for social services organizations in the identified eight-county area. This data can inform the development of goals and plans of action to competitively align the organizations and businesses with similar businesses and organizations in the region and in the state.

> This project was supported and funded by the Highland County Community Action Organization. Much gratitude goes to Julia Wise, the Highland County Community Action Board of Directors and the individuals responding to the survey in the eight counties for their valuable input for this project.
> For additional information on this report, contact Julia Wise, Highland County Community Action Organization at 937-393-3458

## Executive Summary

## Executive Summary

This report summarizes the results of an eight-county compensation study, commissioned and funded by the Highland County Community Action Organization and conducted by Ohio State University (OSU) Extension researchers. The web-based survey was administered during February and March 2013 and includes data gathered from 32 social services organizations in eight counties located in southern Ohio. The counties surveyed include: Adams, Brown, Clinton, Fayette, Highland, Pickaway, Pike and Ross.

The counties participating in the study have an average population of 44,066 and are primarily rural, with small cities and towns located throughout. The average rate of unemployment, as reported by the Ohio Department
 of Jobs and Family Services in March 2013, was $9.9 \%$, with a range of $7.2 \%$ to $13.4 \%$, representing an average unemployment rate significantly higher than the state average of 7.3\%.

The researchers gathered information from human resource managers or similar organization administrators. The survey questions asked respondents to provide information related to wages, benefits and other forms of compensation. Fifteen job classifications found in the social services sector were discussed in the study including: Executive directors, finance managers, program directors and managers, accountants, social workers, a variety of teachers and teachers' aides/assistants, food preparation workers, nurses, receptionists, administrative assistants, bus or van drivers, delivery drivers, and weatherization inspectors. Job descriptions were compared to classifications utilized by the U.S. Bureau of Labor Statistics and categorized accordingly.

## About the Organizations

- $81 \%$ of responding organizations are publically funded
- More than $90 \%$ of the organizations have 26 or more employees
- $72 \%$ of the organizations have more than 50 employees
- More than 2,300 volunteers assist the responding organizations with carrying out their missions


## Top 5 Services Provided by the Responding Organizations



## About the Workforce

Respondents were asked to rate the characteristics of the available workforce in the area, with specific attention to the quality of the workers, the number of qualified/trained/educated workers, the availability of qualified workers, and the stability of the workforce. The responses to each category are illustrated below.

## Quality of the Workforce



Workforce Quantity


## Availability of Workers



Stability of the Workforce


## Compensation

Wage rates for sixteen occupational categories were compiled and compared with the most recent state and national wage rates available (May 2012) based on Occupational Employment Statistics (OES) from the U.S. Bureau of Labor Statistics. As part of the study design, regional occupation categories were aligned with OES categories for comparison purposes.

## Executive Directors

- With the exception of one, all of the organizations, both public and private, responding to the survey, employ an Executive Director. This position represents the highest level of management within the organization, responsible for personnel oversight and policy formation.
- The mean hourly wage for Executive Directors represented in the study range from $\$ 37.79$ for entry level leaders, to $\$ 52.14$ for more experienced leaders, with an average of \$43.56.
- The Executive Director average wage of $\$ 43.56$ is nearly half that of the Ohio average Executive Director wage of $\$ 84.72$.


## Finance Directors

- $94 \%$ of the organizations in the study employ a Finance Director, responsible for planning and directing the accounting activities of the organization.
- The mean hourly wage for the Finance Directors in the study is $\$ 32.12$, compared to the Ohio mean hourly wage of $\$ 52.03$

The chart on following page compares the average hourly wages for the identified positions in the study with the average hourly wages in Ohio and the U.S.

| Position Title | 8-County Average <br> Hourly Wage | Ohio Average <br> Hourly Wage | U.S. Average <br> Hourly Wage |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Executive Director | $\$ 42.49$ | $\$ 84.72$ | $\$ 85.02$ |
| Finance Manager | $\$ 32.12$ | $\$ 52.03$ | $\$ 59.26$ |
| Program Director | $\$ 28.67$ | $\$ 51.32$ | $\$ 55.22$ |
| Program Manager | $\$ 23.46$ | $\$ 30.54$ | $\$ 30.99$ |
| Accountant | $\$ 18.66$ | $\$ 34.15$ | $\$ 32.15$ |
| Social Worker | $\$ 18.39$ | $\$ 19.36$ | $\$ 21.78$ |
| Preschool/Special <br> Education Teacher | $\$ 21.60$ | $\$ 25.79$ | $\$ 25.79$ |
| Teacher Assistant | $\$ 10.95$ | $\$ 11.38$ | $\$ 11.30$ |
| Registered Nurse | $\$ 25.34$ | $\$ 29.31$ | $\$ 32.66$ |
| Food Preparation Worker | $\$ 11.63$ | $\$ 10.22$ | $\$ 10.05$ |
| Human Resource <br> Coordinator/Assistant | $\$ 19.63$ | $\$ 18.02$ | $\$ 18.43$ |
| Receptionist | $\$ 13.88$ | $\$ 12.11$ | $\$ 13.00$ |
| Administrative Assistant | $\$ 19.36$ | $\$ 21.81$ | $\$ 24.14$ |
| Weatherization/General <br> Construction Trade | $\$ 19.43$ | $\$ 23.20$ | $\$ 26.55$ |
| Bus or Van Driver | $\$ 12.72$ | $\$ 12.72$ | $\$ 13.50$ |
| Delivery Driver | $\$ 8.77$ | $\$ 15.52$ | $\$ 16.32$ |

## Program Directors and Managers

- $73 \%$ of the organizations in the study employ one or more Program Directors.
- The mean hourly wage for Program Directors in the study is $\$ 28.67$, which just under $52 \%$ of the state mean hourly wage of $\$ 51.32$.
- $44 \%$ of the responding organizations employ one or more Program Managers.
- The mean hourly wage for Program Managers in the study compares more favorably than the previously mentioned management positions when compared to state average wages. The mean hourly wage for Program Managers in the study is $\$ 23.46$, which is nearly $77 \%$ of the state mean hourly wage of $\$ 30.54$.


## Accountants

- $75 \%$ of the organizations in the study employ an Accountant.
- When compared to the state mean hourly wage, Accountants in the study earn nearly $55 \%$ less at $\$ 18.66$ than that the state mean hourly wage of $\$ 32.15$.


## Social Workers

- $56 \%$ of the responding organizations employ Social Workers.
- Wages for this position are equitable with state mean hourly wages. The mean hourly wage for Social Workers in the study is $\$ 18.39$, compared to the state mean hourly wage of $\$ 19.36$


## Preschool/Special Education Teachers and Teacher Assistants

- 70\% of the responding organizations employ preschool/special education teacher positions.
- The mean hourly wage for teachers in the study is $\$ 18.66$, compared to the state mean hourly wage of $\$ 25.79$.
- Nearly 56\% of the responding organizations employ Teacher Assistants.
- The mean hourly wage of Teacher Assistants in the study is $\$ 10.95$ compared to the state mean hourly wage of $\$ 11.38$.


## Registered Nurses

- 69\% of the responding organizations employ a Registered Nurse.
- Registered Nurses in the study earn a mean hourly wage of $\$ 25.34$, compared to the state mean hourly wage of $\$ 29.31$.


## Food Preparation Workers

- More than 185 food preparation workers are employed by $69 \%$ of organizations responding to the study.
- The mean hourly wage of $\$ 13.30$ is similar to the state mean hourly wage of $\$ 13.44$.


## Human Resource Assistants \& Administrative Assistants

- Nearly 70\% of the organizations in the study employ Human Resource Assistants.
- The mean hourly wage of the responding organizations for Human Resource Assistants at $\$ 19.63$, fares better than the state mean hourly wage of $\$ 18.02$.
- Two-thirds of the respondents in the study employ Administrative Assistants.
- Administrative Assistants in the study earn a mean hourly wage of $\$ 19.36$, compared to the state mean hourly wage of $\$ 21.82$.


## Receptionists

- $75 \%$ of the organizations in the study employ Receptionists.
- The mean hourly wage of Receptionists in the study is $15 \%$ higher, at $\$ 13.88$, than the state mean hourly wage of $\$ 12.11$.


## Weatherization Inspector or General Construction Position

- $28 \%$ of the responding organizations employ a Weatherization Inspector or General Construction Position.
- The mean hourly wage for these workers in the study is $\$ 11.88$, compared to the state mean hourly wage of $\$ 19.10$.


## Bus and Delivery Drivers

- $66 \%$ of the organizations in the study employ Bus Drivers at a mean hourly wage of $\$ 12.72$, compared to the state mean hourly wage of $\$ 13.50$.
- $5 \%$ of the organizations in the study employ Delivery Drivers.
- The mean hourly wage of the Delivery Drivers in the study is $\$ 8.77$, which is about $57 \%$ of the state average of $\$ 15.52$.


## Employee Benefits

OSU researchers examined a variety of employee benefits in the study: medical/health insurance, time-off, retirement and other benefits.

## Health Insurance

Employers in the study provide a variety of health insurance coverage options:

| Type of Insurance | Percent of Organizations <br> in the Study <br> Providing Coverage |
| :---: | :---: |
| Health insurance | $96.4 \%$ |
| Health insurance (part-time employees) | $64.3 \%$ |
| Health insurance (family/dependents) | $92.9 \%$ |
| Dental insurance | $89.3 \%$ |
| Dental insurance (part-time employees) | $50.0 \%$ |
| Dental insurance (family/dependents) | $85.7 \%$ |
| Vision | $82.1 \%$ |
| Vision (part-time employees) | $50.0 \%$ |
| Vision (family/dependents) | $75.0 \%$ |
| Group life insurance | $82.1 \%$ |
| Long term disability insurance | $50.0 \%$ |

## Employer Cost of Health Insurance

| Coverage | Type of Insurance |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Health |  |  | Dental |  |  | Vision |  |  |
|  | Total Average Cost | $\begin{gathered} \text { Avg. } \\ \text { \% } \\ \text { Share } \end{gathered}$ | Employer Share | Total Average Cost | $\begin{gathered} \text { Avg. } \\ \text { \% } \\ \text { Share } \end{gathered}$ | Employer Share | Total Average Cost | $\begin{gathered} \text { Avg. } \\ \text { \% } \\ \text { Share } \\ \hline \end{gathered}$ | Employer Share |
| Employee | \$6,782 | 81.3\% | \$5,514 | \$369 | 75.7\% | \$279 | \$92 | 68.4\% | \$70 |
| Part-time | \$4,478 | 85.9\% | \$3,847 | \$202 | 94\% | \$190 | \$57 | 92\% | \$52 |
| Family | \$15,885 | 69.2\% | \$10,997 | \$833 | 70\% | \$583 | \$166 | 53.2\% | \$88 |
| Totals | \$27,145 | 78.8\% | \$20,358 | \$1,404 | 79.9\% | \$1,052 | \$315 | 71.2\% | \$210 |

## Time-Off Benefits

- A majority of employees in the responding organizations receive between 10-15 days of vacation annually - either at employment or within two years on the job.
- The organizations in the study also provide up to 15 days annually for sick time off.


## Retirement and Other Benefits

- Nearly $50 \%$ of employers in the study provide traditional pension plans for employees.
- Defined contribution plans are offered by 34\% of employers.
- All of the respondents participate in some type of retirement plan, most citing the Ohio Public Employees Retirement System.
- Other benefits are also offered by employers in the study include family/medical leave, maternity leave, paternity leave, jury duty leave, military service leave, a health/wellness program, and personal paid time-off.

For more detailed information related to compensation, benefits, job duties, and education/training/licensure/certification requirements for each position, please refer to the Survey Results section of this report, beginning on page 16.

## Survey Process and Methodology

The Highland County Community Action Organization, Inc. (HCCAO) contracted with OSU researchers to conduct an online survey that was posted during February and March 2013. The purpose of the survey is to collect wage and benefit information for the social services sector in an eight-county region of southern Ohio. Results of the survey will help the sector organizations gain a better understanding of wage and benefit levels for similar types of positions across like organizations within the eight-county region and in comparison with state and national averages.

OSU Extension researchers developed a database of contacts within 62 social services organizations, including human resource and management personnel. All of the organizations received formal letters of invitation to participate in the survey in late February 2013. Targeted organizations were either public or private entities but shared similar job categories that included a mixture of health, education and social services, as well as both administrative and hourly positions.

Letters of invitation were followed up with e-mail notices and a web-based link to the survey, including instructions for completion. Researchers sent two e-mail reminders and made several phone calls during the collection period. Of the 62 organizations, 32 completed the survey for a 52 percent response rate.

## Survey Design

Researchers designed the survey in consultation with the HCCAO to include questions that adequately reflect wage and benefit levels for occupational categories within the social services sector in the eight-county region. The survey included the following sections:

1. Organizational information
2. General workforce information
3. Insurance benefits
4. Paid time off and other benefits
5. Compensation and job requirements
6. Contact information

Occupational information was prepared by gathering job descriptions for positions within the HCCAO as a baseline. Twenty-nine job descriptions were inventoried, analyzed and matched with the Occupational Employment Classification codes using the Bureau of Labor Statistics (www.bls.gov) information. These occupations were then grouped into 15 categories based on similar characteristics including administrative or hourly, wage levels,
licensing and degree requirements, and type of position.

The survey included questions that covered general information about the organizations and more detailed information about the 15 job categories. Information gathered for each job category included: number of employees, average salary, educational requirements, and license or certification requirements. Results were then compared with federal wage and benefit levels for like job categories to provide a universal perspective of how social services organizations compare relative to these variables.

Survey Results

## Survey Results

Described in this section are results for the wage and benefit survey. The following sections will cover results for three separate sections: organizational information, benefits and compensation.

## Organizational Information

The first section of the survey seeks to understand the organizational profile, including type of organization, services provided, workforce size and quality. Chart 1 indicates that, of the 31 organizations that responded to the survey, over 81 percent of the respondents reported they are public organizations and almost 19 percent are privately held social services organizations.


Chart 2 indicates that the majority of the responding organizations, or 62.5 percent, provide education services to clientele. Forty percent provide health care services and over 30 percent are providing either food and nutrition or family development-related services. Family development and housing services are offered by 25 percent of the respondents. Five organizations (15.6\%) indicated they provide services in either income management or economic development.

## Chart 2: Services Provided



Nearly three-quarters of the responding organizations have more than 50 employees. None have five employees or less and nine organizations fall somewhere in-between, employing between six and 50 employees. As Table 1 indicates, the vast majority of the organizations, 29 of the 32 respondents or over 90 percent, have 26 employees or more.


Respondents reported a total of just over 2,300 volunteers across the region working for them in a social services capacity. With five organizations not responding to this question, this brings the averages to about 100 volunteers per organization. Five respondents reported hiring over 100 volunteers, while 10 indicated they hire between 25-100 regularly. Respondents were also asked to rate the regional workforce with the following rating scale: Excellent, Good, Average, Fair, Poor and Very Poor. The attributes they were
asked to rate were Quality, Quantity, Availability, and Stability. "Quality" was rated the highest with 73 percent of respondents giving it an excellent or good score, followed "Availability" and "Quantity" upon which respondents agreed 62.5 percent of the time is excellent or good. Over half of the respondents rated "Stability" better than average

Chart 4: Workforce Strength Indicators


## Insurance Benefits

OSU researchers posed three types of questions related to employee benefits: medical/health insurance, time off, retirement and other benefits. The first section addresses medical/health insurance benefits. Table 1 indicates the percent of respondents who offer health, dental, vision, life and disability insurances to employees.

Table 1: Employer Insurance Participation Rates

| Type of Insurance | Percent <br> Providing <br> Coverage | Number of <br> Respondents |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Health insurance | $96.4 \%$ | 27 |
| Health insurance (part-time employees) | $64.3 \%$ | 18 |
| Health insurance (family/dependents) | $92.9 \%$ | 26 |
| Dental insurance | $89.3 \%$ | 25 |
| Dental insurance (part-time employees) | $50.0 \%$ | 14 |
| Dental insurance (family/dependents) | $85.7 \%$ | 24 |
| Vision | $82.1 \%$ | 23 |
| Vision (part-time employees) | $50.0 \%$ | 14 |
| Vision (family/dependents) | $75.0 \%$ | 21 |
| Group life insurance | $82.1 \%$ | 23 |
| Long term disability insurance | $50.0 \%$ | 14 |
| Short term disability insurance | $46.4 \%$ | 13 |
| Long term care insurance | $46.4 \%$ | 13 |

All but four, or over 93 percent of respondents, offer health insurance. Almost all of these ( $90 \%$ ) provide health insurance coverage to families, while a little more than 53 percent offer this insurance to part-time employees. Dental is offered by 83.3 percent of employers to both individual employees and their families. Twenty-three respondents or 76.7 percent offer vision to employees. Both dental and vision are offered to part-time employees by 16 of the respondents, or just over 53 percent. Group life is offered to employees by 80 percent of the employer respondents, and both short and long-term disability is available by 17 of the respondents, or 56.7 percent.

Table 2 provides an overview of the survey responses to answer the insurance cost question. The table includes breakdown of costs for health, dental and vision for full and part-time employees, and family or dependents. These are aggregate averages for all respondent organizations. Overall, employers are paying on average \$5,514 for health insurance, $\$ 279$ for dental, and $\$ 70$ for vision for full-time employees.

Table 2: Employer Cost of Health Insurance

| Coverage | Type of Insurance |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Health |  |  | Dental |  |  | Vision |  |  |
|  | Total Average Cost | Avg. \% <br> Share | Employer Share | Total Average Cost | Avg. \% Share | Employer Share | Total Average Cost | Avg. \% <br> Share | Employer Share |
| Employee | \$6,782 | 81.3\% | \$5,514 | \$369 | 75.7\% | \$279 | \$92 | 68.4\% | \$70 |
| Part-time | \$4,478 | 85.9\% | \$3,847 | \$202 | 94\% | \$190 | \$57 | 92\% | \$52 |
| Family | \$15,885 | 69.2\% | \$10,997 | \$833 | 70\% | \$583 | \$166 | 53.2\% | \$88 |
| Totals | \$27,145 | 78.8\% | \$20,358 | \$1,404 | 79.9\% | \$1,052 | \$315 | 71.2\% | \$210 |

Employee share can also be derived from Table 2 (total cost - employer share) with fulltime employees expected to pay, on average, $\$ 1,268$ for health, $\$ 90$ for dental, and $\$ 22$ for vision annually. The cost of providing coverage for dependents increases significantly as shown in the table. Only four of the respondent employers provide insurance benefits to part-time workers and, despite the small sample size, these aggregated numbers are also shown.

The survey also requested information from employers on insurance cost questions regarding group life, long and short-term disability insurance, and long term care. Respondents overwhelming indicate they provide coverage at an average rate of 99 percent coverage for group life, which averages just under \$60 per employee. None of the respondents, however, indicated a cost participation for the other insurance types. This does not necessarily mean that coverage is not provided, but that the question may have been skipped by the respondents.

## Time-Off Benefits

Chart 5 presents the range of vacation days by length of employment based on the number of employee responses. The results suggest that most employees, whether at employment, after 2 years, or at maximum, are receiving between 10-15 days of vacation annually. Twenty-five percent (8) of the respondents report that, at employment, employees receive $0-5$ days. For new hires, this percentage rises to 37.5 percent for between 0-10 days of vacation.

After two years, employees are receiving markedly more vacation days with 86 percent or 25 of the 29 employers who responded, indicating that they receive 10-15 days off. None of the employers report that new hires or employees, after two years in the job, receive 15 days or more. Only four employers indicate that, after two years, employees receive 0-10 days.

Sixty-three percent (with 30 responses received) of employers indicate that employees who have maxed out time-off benefits are receiving $15+$ days of vacation, while ten employers - or 33 percent - say that at maximum, they will receive 10-15 days. Just one employer reports 5-10 days of vacation for employees at the maximum.

Chart 5: Vacation Time-Off by Number of Days


Chart 6 presents sick days off (medical leave) by length of employment. Eight of the respondents indicate that employees just starting on the job receive between 0-5 days, while four provide for 5-10 days and 18 give the new employees up to 15 sick days. None of the new employees receive more than 15 days. Seventy-eight percent of the respondents (25) indicate that after 2 years, employees will be given between $10-15$ sick days. At maximum employment, a majority ( $60 \%$ ) of the respondents provide 15 or sicker days.

Chart 6: Number of Sick Days by Length of Employment


## Retirement and Other Benefits

Nearly 50 percent of the social services employers in the 8-County region offer traditional pension plans to their employees (Table 3). Defined contribution plans are offered by about 34 percent of employers, either as an alternative, or in addition to traditional pension plans. In addition, about 15 percent offer incentives or bonuses. Overall, all respondents indicate that they participate in some type of retirement plan, typically through the Ohio Public Employees Retirement System.

Table 3: Employer Participation in Retirement Plans

| Type of Plan | \# Participating | \# Matching | \% <br> Participation |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Traditional Pension Plans | 19 | 8 | $59.4 \%$ |
| Defined Contribution (401K, 403B, IRA, etc.) | 11 | 7 | $34.4 \%$ |
| Incentives or Bonuses | 5 | N/A | $15.6 \%$ |

Chart 7: Retirement Benefits


Respondent employers offer other benefits as part of a comprehensive benefit package. Chart 8 shows the various types of benefits and level of participation by employers. For instance, an almost 55 percent offer health and wellness program, personal time off is provided by over 87 percent and paternity leave is an employee option for almost 40 percent of respondents.

Chart 8: Other Benefits Offered by Employers


## Compensation

This section provides wage data by occupation category for organizations surveyed in the study area. Wage rates for sixteen occupational categories were compiled and compared with the most recent state and national wage rates available (May 2012) based on Occupational Employment Statistics (OES) from the U.S. Bureau of Labor Statistics. As part of the study design, regional occupation categories were aligned with OES's for comparison purposes. The following Table 4 lists of occupational information for the 8-County region, including corresponding OES code and title, number and percent of organizations that employ each position, and the total number of employees within the region employed with the responding organizations.

Table 4: Inventory of 8-County Positions and Corresponding OEC Titles

| Position Title | Corresponding OES \#/Title | \#/\% <br> Employers * | Total \# Employees |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1. Executive Director | 11-1011/Chief Executives | 31/97\% | 31 |
| 2. Finance Manager | 11-3051/Finance Managers | 30/94\% | 30 |
| 3. Program Director | 11-1021/General and Operations Managers | 23/72\% | 95 |
| 4. Program Manager | 11-9151/Social and Community Service Managers | 14/44\% | 37 |
| 5. Accountant | 13-2011/Accountants and Auditors | 24/75\% | 40 |
| 6. Social Worker | 21-1021/Child, Family, and School Social Workers | 18/56\% | 93 |
| 7. Preschool Teacher/Special Education Teacher | 25-2011/Preschool Teachers | 22/69\% | 175 |
| 8. Teacher Assistant | 25-9041/Teacher Assistants | 18/56\% | 317 |
| 9. Registered Nurse | 29-1111/Registered Nurses | 22/69\% | 264 |
| 10. Food Preparation Worker | 35-2012/Cooks, Institution and Cafeteria | 22/69\% | 186.5 |
| 11. Human Resource Coordinator/Assistant | 43-4161/Human Resources <br> Assistants | 14/44\% | 14 |
| 12. Receptionist | 43-4171/Receptionists and Information Clerks | 24/75\% | 89 |
| 13. Administrative Assistant | 43-6011/Executive Secretaries and Administrative Assistants | 21/66\% | 45 |
| 14. Weatherization Inspector or General Construction Trade | 47-4011/Construction and Building Inspectors | 9/28\% | 21 |
| 15. Bus or Van Driver | 53-3022/Bus Drivers, School or Special Client | 21/66\% | 307 |
| 16. Delivery Driver | 53-3033/Light Truck or Delivery Services Drivers | 5/16\% | 30 |

* Indicates the number, and percent, of employer respondents in the 8-County region that employ each type of position.

Table 5 provides an overview of the mean and median wages for each of the positions at the 'Current Average' level, with the state mean included to offer a comparison.

Table 5: Overview of Average Current Mean in Comparison to State and U.S. Means

| Position Title | 8-County Mean <br> Average Current) <br> Hourly Wage | Ohio Mean <br> Average Current) <br> Hourly Wage | U.S. Mean <br> (Average) <br> Hourly Wage | 8-County <br> Wage $\%$ <br> of Ohio |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Executive Director | $\$ 42.49$ | $\$ 84.72$ | $\$ 85.02$ | $50.2 \%$ |
| Finance Manager | $\$ 32.12$ | $\$ 52.03$ | $\$ 59.26$ | $61.7 \%$ |
| Program Director | $\$ 28.67$ | $\$ 51.32$ | $\$ 55.22$ | $51.9 \%$ |
| Program Manager | $\$ 23.46$ | $\$ 30.54$ | $\$ 30.99$ | $76.8 \%$ |
| Accountant | $\$ 18.66$ | $\$ 34.15$ | $\$ 32.15$ | $54.6 \%$ |
| Social Worker | $\$ 18.39$ | $\$ 19.36$ | $\$ 21.78$ | $95 \%$ |
| Preschool/Special <br> Education Teacher | $\$ 21.60$ | $\$ 25.79$ | $\$ 25.79$ | $83.8 \%$ |
| Teacher Assistant | $\$ 10.95$ | $\$ 11.38$ | $\$ 11.30$ | $96.2 \%$ |
| Registered Nurse | $\$ 25.34$ | $\$ 29.31$ | $\$ 32.66$ | $86.5 \%$ |
| Food Preparation Worker | $\$ 11.63$ | $\$ 10.22$ | $\$ 10.05$ | $113.8 \%$ |
| Human Resource <br> Coordinator/Assistant | $\$ 19.63$ | $\$ 18.02$ | $\$ 18.43$ | $109 \%$ |
| Receptionist | $\$ 13.88$ | $\$ 12.11$ | $\$ 13.00$ | $114.6 \%$ |
| Administrative Assistant | $\$ 19.36$ | $\$ 21.81$ | $\$ 24.14$ | $88.8 \%$ |
| Weatherization/General <br> Construction Trade | $\$ 19.43$ | $\$ 23.20$ | $\$ 26.55$ | $83.75 \%$ |
| Bus or Van Driver | $\$ 12.72$ | $\$ 12.72$ | $\$ 13.50$ | $1 \%$ |
| Delivery Driver | $\$ 8.77$ | $\$ 15.52$ | $\$ 16.32$ | $56.5 \%$ |

The tables in the following section provide profiles of each of the 16 positions included in this study. The profiles present aggregate hourly wage data for each job category, with both the mean (average) and median (mid-point) wages for entry level, average current, and maximum levels (see definitions below). Education and licensing requirements for each job category are also described in this section.

- Entry level refers to the average of all starting level rates reported for employees in a particular job category.
- Average current refers to the average of all mean wage rates reported for employees in a particular job category.
- Maximum level refers to the average of the entire highest wage rates reported for employees in a particular job category.
- Mean is a simple average of wages for each job category figured by multiplying the wage by the number of employees for a position with each organization, adding up the total and dividing that number by the total of all employees reported for that position by all organizations.
- Median is the mid-point wage for all employees within each job classification across all reporting organizations, where 50 percent of wages fall.


## Executive Director Position

The Executive Director position is equivalent to the national OES classification of Chief Executive serving both public and private organizations. Almost 100 percent of responding organizations (all but one) employ an Executive Director (Table 4). This is the highest level of management within an organization, responsible for overseeing all staff, formulating policy and providing overall direction. Table 6 indicates the compensation rates for entry level, average current and at maximum for this position, ranging from almost $\$ 38$ hourly for entry level to a maximum level of about $\$ 52$ hourly.

Table 6: Executive Director Compensation

| Position Level | Mean <br> Hourly Wage | Median <br> Hourly Wage |
| :--- | :---: | :---: |
| Entry Level | $\$ 37.79$ | $\$ 30.00$ |
| Average Current | $\$ 43.56$ | $\$ 42.49$ |
| Maximum | $\$ 52.14$ | $\$ 45.92$ |

Table 7 indicates that the eight-county region mean wage rate is about half the state or national hourly wage rate for this position. This represents a wage rate much lower than the state or national averages. This could be explained, in part, to the fact that most of the responding organizations in the study area are public, while the state and national rates include a predominance of data for private companies. Private companies have the tendency to pay higher rates.

| Table 7: Compensation Comparison by Area (Regional, State, U.S.) |  |  |  |  |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Area <br> Total Area <br> Employment | Median (50\%) <br> Hourly Wage | Mean (average) <br> Hourly Wage |  |  |
| 8-County | 31 | $\$ 42.49$ | $\$ 42.49$ |  |
| Statewide | 8,310 | $\$ 82.46$ | $\$ 84.72$ |  |
| U.S. | 255,940 | $\$ 80.84$ | $\$ 85.02$ |  |

Chart 9 presents the educational requirements for the Executive Director position. None of the respondents indicated that the position would require either less than a high school diploma or an associate's degree. Of the other choices, nearly 70 percent (67.7\%) require a Master's degree or higher. A full 60 percent require, at minimum, a Master's degree. About 28 percent of the respondents require at least a Bachelor's degree and 7\% require a high school diploma.

In addition to educational requirements, over 51 percent of the respondents indicate that
the Executive Director is required to have some type of license or certification. Over 32 percent of respondents require the Executive Director to be a licensed Superintendent through the Ohio Department of Education. One respondent requires that the Executive Director have a Doctoral Degree in Medicine.

## Chart 9: Executive Director Educational Requirements



$$
\begin{aligned}
& \text { םHS (High school) } \\
& \text { םBA/BS (Bachelor's degree) } \\
& \text { םMA/MS (Master's degree) } \\
& \text { םPhD or Professional }
\end{aligned}
$$

## Finance Director Position

The Finance Director position is equivalent to the national OES classification of Financial Manager with responsibilities including planning and directing the accounting activities of the organization. All but two of the responding organizations in the eight-county region employ a Finance Director. Table 8 provides compensation rates for entry level, average current and maximum for the Finance Director position, with average ranges from $\$ 26.37$ hourly for entry level to a maximum level of over $\$ 37$ per hour. Median hourly wage is from $\$ 23.50$ to $\$ 35$ per hour, demonstrating the mid-point wage rate for the position levels.

| Table 8: Finance Director Compensation |  |  |
| :--- | :---: | :---: |
| Position Level | Mean Hourly <br> Wage | Median Hourly <br> Wage |
| Entry Level | $\$ 26.37$ | $\$ 23.50$ |
| Average Current | $\$ 32.12$ | $\$ 31.31$ |
| Maximum | $\$ 37.20$ | $\$ 35.00$ |

Table 9 demonstrates that the average mean and median wage rates for the Finance Director position in the 8-County region is a little more than 60 percent of the national wage rate and 67 percent of the state rate. This also represents a much lower wage rate for this position in the region than either the state or U.S. Similar to what was found for the

Executive Director position, this could possibly be explained due to private sector influence and a much broader sample size for both the state and nation.

Table 9: Compensation Comparison by Area (Regional, State, U.S.)

| Area | Total Area <br> Employment | Median (50\%) <br> Hourly Wage | Mean (average) <br> Hourly Wage |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 8-County | 30 | $\$ 31.31$ | $\$ 32.12$ |
| Statewide | 18,170 | $\$ 46.96$ | $\$ 52.03$ |
| U.S. | 484,910 | $\$ 52.76$ | $\$ 59.26$ |

Educational requirements for the Finance Director position are depicted in Chart 10, which shows that almost 80 percent of the respondents require a Bachelor's degree and 21.5 percent requiring at least a high school diploma. None of the respondents indicated requiring a degree higher than a Bachelor's, although over 31 percent require a professional license or certification. Five respondents specified the need for a Treasurer License from the Ohio Department of Education.

## Chart 10: Finance Director Educational Requirements



- HS (High school)
$\square \mathrm{AD}$ (Associate's degree)
■BA/BS (Bachelor's degree)


## Program Director Position

The Program Director position is paired with the national OES classification number 111021 for General and Operations Managers. The position has broad supervisory and administrative responsibilities that include coordinating and directing the day-to-day operations of organizations or programs. Seventy-three percent of the respondents employ up to ten Director positions within their organizations for a total of 95 Program Director positions in the eight-county region.

The ranges of hourly wages for this position are listed in Table 10. Average (mean) wages
range from $\$ 20.53$ for entry level to $\$ 35.36$ at maximum. The average mean wage is $\$ 28.67$ per hour. Median wages do not deviate much from the mean, ranging from almost $\$ 21$ to \$33 hourly.

| Table 10: Program Director Compensation |  |  |
| :--- | :---: | :---: |
| Position Level | Mean Hourly <br> Wage | Median Hourly <br> Wage |
| Entry Level | $\$ 20.53$ | $\$ 20.97$ |
| Average Current | $\$ 28.67$ | $\$ 28.07$ |
| Maximum | $\$ 35.36$ | $\$ 33.00$ |

Table 11 compares the average mean and median wage rates for the Program Director position in the eight-county region with the state and national wage rates. The mean wage for this position in the eight-county region is just under 52 percent of the U.S. mean for the same position and almost 56 percent of Ohio's mean. Median wages were a little closer in line between all areas with the eight-county median within 40 percent of both the state and national median wages. Regardless, there remains a wide gap between wages for this position within the eight-county region as compared to both the state and nation.

| Table 11: Compensation Comparison by Area (Regional, State, U.S.) |  |  |  |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Area <br> Total Area <br> Employment |  | Median (50\%) <br> Hourly Wage | Mean (average) <br> Hourly Wage |
| 8-County | 95 | $\$ 28.07$ | $\$ 28.67$ |
| Statewide | 55,580 | $\$ 43.16$ | $\$ 51.32$ |
| U.S. | $1,899,460$ | $\$ 45.88$ | $\$ 55.22$ |

Almost 55 percent of respondents require at least a Bachelor's degree for this position. A Master's Degree is required by over 22 percent and the same percentage requires at a minimum, graduation from high school. Fourteen of the respondents require a professional certification or license. Several respondents indicated that the license or certification depends on the program area. Three require an Administrative certification and two indicated that a State of Ohio Principal certification is needed.

## Chart 11: Program Director Educational requirements



ロHS (High school)
$\square B A / B S$ (Bachelor's degree)
■MA/MS (Master's degree)

## Program Manager Position

Thirty-seven Program Managers are employed within 44 percent, or 14, of the responding organizations. The position is aligned with the Social and Community Services Manager OES classification with the Bureau of Labor Statistics. These are highly responsible positions tasked with planning, directing and coordinating the activities of social services programs and overseeing staff as necessary.

Table 12 indicates the mean and median wage ranges, which fall between a low of almost $\$ 19$ per hour at entry level to a high of about $\$ 29$ hourly. Median wages ranged from $\$ 17$ to $\$ 27$ per hour, a difference of $\$ 10$ per hour under both (mean and median) scenarios.

Table 12: Program Manager Compensation

| Position Level | Mean Hourly <br> Wage | Median Hourly <br> Wage |
| :--- | :---: | :---: |
| Entry Level | $\$ 18.57$ | $\$ 17.00$ |
| Average Current | $\$ 23.46$ | $\$ 21.40$ |
| Maximum | $\$ 28.98$ | $\$ 27.00$ |

Mean and median wages for the Program Manager position compare more favorably than previous higher-level management positions in terms of wage disparity (see Table 13). The mean wage of $\$ 23.46$ hourly is almost 77 percent of the Ohio wage for the similar position and 75 percent of the national wage. Since the comparison is with same positions in the social services sector, wages are probably more in line as a result. The median wage drops to 73 percent of the Ohio and just over 74 percent of the national wage levels.

Table 13: Compensation Comparison by Area (Regional, State, U.S.)

| Area | Total Area <br> Employment | Median (50\%) <br> Hourly Wage | Mean (average) <br> Hourly Wage |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 8-County | 37 | $\$ 21.40$ | $\$ 23.46$ |
| Statewide | 4,020 | $\$ 29.27$ | $\$ 30.54$ |
| U.S. | 115,360 | $\$ 28.83$ | $\$ 30.99$ |

As far as educational requirements, the majority (over 58 percent) of eight-county employers require that Program Managers have a minimum of a Bachelor's degree. Almost 17 percent require a Master's degree and another 17 percent require completion of high school. Fifty percent of the employers who responded (14 total) require some type of license or certification. A teacher certification and/or nursing license is required by at least four employers.

## Chart 12: Program Manager Eduational Requirements



## Accountant Position

A total of 40 accountants are employed with 24 of the 32 respondent organizations. The position, according to the OES definition, examines, analyzes and interprets accounting records to prepare financial statements, give advice, or audit and evaluate statements prepared by others.

Mean and median wage levels are provided in Table 14. The range of mean wages from entry level to maximum is a little over $\$ 8$ per hour; almost $\$ 10$ for the median wage range. The median wage for entry level demonstrates the "at hire" for an accountant position with a minimum high school diploma (see educational requirements). At maximum, the Accountant position will earn, at average, $\$ 22.47$ hourly.

| Table 14: Accountant Compensation |  |  |
| :--- | :---: | :---: |
| Position Level | Mean Hourly <br> Wage | Median Hourly <br> Wage |
| Entry Level | $\$ 12.61$ | $\$ 13.56$ |
| Average Current | $\$ 18.66$ | $\$ 18.93$ |
| Maximum | $\$ 22.47$ | $\$ 21.73$ |

In comparison with the state and national wage rates for this position, the accountant is earning much less. At an average current wage of $\$ 18.66$ per hour, the wage for this position is $54.6 \%$ of the wage for the same position within the state of Ohio. Again, this may possibly be due to a skew towards earnings in the private sector, which tend to be higher for this type of position. As shown in Table 15, the median (mid-point) hourly wage for this position is slightly higher at $\$ 18.93$, still not in keeping with the state or U.S. median wages which are at $\$ 32.15$ and $\$ 34.15$ respectively.

| Table 15: Compensation Comparison by Area (Regional, State, U.S.) |  |  |  |  |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Area <br> Total Area <br> Employment | Median (50\%) <br> Hourly Wage | Mean (average) <br> Hourly Wage |  |  |
| 8-County | 40 | $\$ 18.93$ | $\$ 18.66$ |  |
| Statewide | 36,420 | $\$ 28.66$ | $\$ 32.15$ |  |
| U.S. | $1,129,340$ | $\$ 30.55$ | $\$ 34.15$ |  |

The vast majority of respondent employers, over 65 percent, indicate that a high school diploma is the primary requirement for this position. None of the respondents require advanced degrees, licenses or certifications, although almost 22 percent require at least an Associates degree. Thirteen percent require a Bachelor's degree.

## Chart 13: Accountant Educational requirements


-HS (High school)
$\square \mathrm{AD}$ (Associate's degree)
$\square B A / B S$ (Bachelor's degree)

## Social Worker Position

Fifty-six percent of the responding organizations employ Social Workers. There are 93 positions employed within the 18 organizations in the eight-county study area, an average of just over 5 social workers per organization. According to OES, social workers provide services and assistance to children and families to maximize their well being. Specific duties range from eligibility and social services processing to finding homes for abused or abandoned children.

Table 16 demonstrates the wage levels for the social worker position in the eight-county region. Average wages at entry level are about $\$ 13.29$, tracking up to a high hourly wage of $\$ 25.67$. Median wages range from $\$ 15$ to $\$ 22.54$ per hour.

Table 16: Social Worker Compensation

| Position Level | Mean Hourly <br> Wage | Median Hourly <br> Wage |
| :--- | :---: | :---: |
| Entry Level | $\$ 13.29$ | $\$ 15.00$ |
| Average Current | $\$ 18.39$ | $\$ 17.25$ |
| Maximum | $\$ 25.67$ | $\$ 22.54$ |

Wages are equitable with state and national levels according to Table 17. At \$18.39, the average wage is just slightly less than the state hourly wage of $\$ 19.36$, and a little higher than national wage of $\$ 18.32$ per hour. The eight-county regional wage for social workers is $95 \%$ of the state wage (see Table 5).

| Table 17: Compensation Comparison by Area (Regional, State, U.S.) |  |  |  |  |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Area | Total Area <br> Employment | Median (50\%) <br> Hourly Wage | Mean (average) <br> Hourly Wage |  |
| 8-County | 93 | $\$ 17.25$ | $\$ 18.39$ |  |
| Statewide | 8,520 | $\$ 18.32$ | $\$ 19.36$ |  |
| U.S. | 273,920 | $\$ 19.97$ | $\$ 18.32$ |  |

Half of the 18 organizations that indicate they employ social workers say they need a certification or license. It is required, according to at least nine of the employers, that social workers be licensed through the State of Ohio. In addition, over 70percent require a Bachelor's degree or higher ( $6 \%$ require a Master's degree). A minimum high school diploma is required by almost 18 percent.


$$
\begin{aligned}
& \text { םHS (High school) } \\
& \square A D \text { (Associate's degree) } \\
& \square B A / B S \text { (Bachelor's degree) } \\
& \square M A / M S \text { (Master's degree) }
\end{aligned}
$$

## Preschool Teacher/Special Education Teacher Position

Almost 70 percent, or 22 or the 32 responding organizations employ preschool/special education teacher positions. A total of 175 persons are employed in this capacity within the eight-county region. This position is responsible for providing educational services to children, implementing individualized learning and also referral services to families.

Table 18 lists mean and median wage levels for preschool/special education teachers. The mean or average hourly wage ranges from $\$ 15.59$ to $\$ 29.78$ hourly while the median wage ranges from $\$ 14.91$ to $\$ 29.52$ per hour. Based on these results, the position is expected to earn about $\$ 67,200$ annually at peak.

| Table 18: Preschool/Special Education Teacher Compensation |  |  |
| :--- | :---: | :---: |
| Position Level | Mean Hourly <br> Wage | Median Hourly <br> Wage |
| Entry Level | $\$ 15.59$ | $\$ 14.91$ |
| Average Current | $\$ 21.60$ | $\$ 22.03$ |
| Maximum | $\$ 29.78$ | $\$ 29.52$ |

State and national wage rates are somewhat higher than the eight-county hourly wage at 83.8 percent of the Ohio wage (see Table 19) and the same for the nation, since data sets are exactly the same for both the state and nation for this position category. One hundred seventy-five people are employed as preschool/special education teachers in the eightcounty region, accounting for close to 25 percent of this position category statewide.

| Table 19: Compensation Comparison by Area (Regional, State, U.S.) |  |  |  |  |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Area <br> Total Area <br> Employment | Median (50\%) <br> Hourly Wage | Mean (average) <br> Hourly Wage |  |  |
| 8-County | 175 | $\$ 18.93$ | $\$ 18.66$ |  |
| Statewide | 710 | $\$ 23.43$ | $\$ 25.79$ |  |
| U.S. | 21,770 | $\$ 23.43$ | $\$ 25.79$ |  |

All respondents require some type of degree, except for a doctorate, for this position. The vast majority, 71.4 percent, requires a Bachelor's degree and almost 24 percent require a Master's degree. An Associates degree is required by about five percent of the respondents. Almost all, over 80 percent, of employers require this position to hold a teacher certificate from the Ohio Department of Education. Several also require completion of an educational program specific to Early Childhood Education.

## Chart 15: Special Education Teacher Educational Requirements


$\square A D$ (Associate's degree)

■BA/BS (Bachelor's degree)
-MA/MS (Master's degree)

## Teacher Assistant Position

About 56 percent (18) of social services employers in the eight-county region employ Teacher Assistants. In fact, the number of teacher assistant positions in the workforce is 317, accounting for the largest single occupation among respondents in the social services sector. Teacher Assistants perform a wide range of instructional duties to service both students and parents and working under the direction of a teacher.

According to Table 20, wage levels range from an average starting wage of $\$ 9.61$ per hour to a maximum of $\$ 13.06$ per hour. At maximum, the median hourly wage is $\$ 15.56$ with a starting median at $\$ 10$ per hour.

Table 20: Teacher Assistant Compensation

| Position Level | Mean Hourly <br> Wage | Median Hourly <br> Wage |
| :--- | :---: | :---: |
| Entry Level | $\$ 9.61$ | $\$ 10.00$ |
| Average Current | $\$ 10.95$ | $\$ 11.26$ |
| Maximum | $\$ 13.06$ | $\$ 15.56$ |

Table 21 is a comparison of the Teacher Assistant hourly wage with state and national wage levels. It shows that the position is higher paid, on average, than both the state and nation. Conversely, the median wage level actually measures less (about 35-40 cents less per hour) than the state and nation.

Table 21: Compensation Comparison by Area (Regional, State, U.S.)

| Area | Total Area <br> Employment | Median (50\%) <br> Hourly Wage | Mean (average) <br> Hourly Wage |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 8-County | 317 | $\$ 11.26$ | $\$ 10.95$ |
| Statewide | 37,530 | $\$ 10.53$ | $\$ 11.38$ |
| U.S. | $1,185,700$ | $\$ 10.55$ | $\$ 11.30$ |

Fourteen of the respondents require Teacher Assistants receive a license or certification with eight specifying they need to obtain a paraprofessional license through the Ohio Department of Education. In addition to the license, 12.5 percent require an Associates Degree and another 6.3, a Bachelor's. None of the respondents require advanced degrees. An overwhelming percentage, 81.3 percent, says they must have a high school diploma.

## Chart 16: Teacher Assistant Educational Requirements



## Registered Nurse Position

The vast majority of organizations, 69 percent, employ registered nurses as part of their workforce. In Table 22 below, wage levels range from a mid-point (median) hourly wage of $\$ 19.23$ to $\$ 29.62$, and the mean range is from $\$ 20.21$ at entry level up to $\$ 33.65$ hourly. Registered Nurses can expect to earn at least $\$ 10$ per hour more at maximum.

| Table 22: Registered Nurse Compensation |  |  |  |
| :--- | ---: | ---: | :---: |
| Mean Hourly <br> Wage | Median Hourly <br> Wage |  |  |
| Entry Level | $\$ 20.21$ | $\$ 19.23$ |  |
| Average Current | $\$ 25.34$ | $\$ 25.62$ |  |
| Maximum | $\$ 33.65$ | $\$ 29.62$ |  |

According to the comparison table below (Table 23) Registered Nurses are paid a mean hourly wage of $\$ 25.34$ in the 8-County region, and while the state and national means are higher, it is not by a big margin. In fact, the mean 8 -County region wage is 86.5 percent of the Ohio wage and 77.6 percent of the U.S. mean wage. The level of employment of Registered Nurses by respondent organizations, 264, is in the top three occupations.

| Table 23: Compensation Comparison by Area (Regional, State, U.S.) |  |  |  |  |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Area | Total Area <br> Employment | Median (50\%) <br> Hourly Wage | Mean (average) <br> Hourly Wage |  |
| 8-County | 264 | $\$ 25.62$ | $\$ 25.34$ |  |
| Statewide | 120,460 | $\$ 28.85$ | $\$ 29.31$ |  |
| U.S. | $2,633,980$ | $\$ 31.48$ | $\$ 32.66$ |  |

Registered Nurses are required by law to hold an Ohio RN license. According to Chart 16, all but about 5 percent of the respondents require an RN license in addition to at least an Associates Degree. About 62 percent require a Bachelor's degree.

## Chart 17: Registered Nurse Educational Requirements



$$
\begin{aligned}
& \square H S \text { (High school) } \\
& \square A D \text { (Associate's degree) } \\
& \square B A / B S \text { (Bachelor's degree) }
\end{aligned}
$$

## Food Preparation Worker Position

There are 186.5 food preparation workers employed with 22 employer respondents according to this study. The average starting hourly wage is just over $\$ 9.50$ per hour. Food preparation workers perform a variety of food preparation duties and handle large quantities of food for institutions and cafeterias. Table 24 also indicates that the maximum mean hourly range is almost $\$ 13.30$ and the median is very close at $\$ 13.44$ hourly.

Table 24: Food Preparation Worker Compensation

| Position Level | Mean Hourly <br> Wage | Median Hourly <br> Wage |
| :--- | :---: | :---: |
| Entry Level | $\$ 9.53$ | $\$ 9.40$ |
| Average Current | $\$ 11.63$ | $\$ 11.49$ |
| Maximum | $\$ 13.29$ | $\$ 13.44$ |

The hourly wage of food preparation workers in the eight-county region compared with the state and national average is $14 \%$ higher than the state and $16 \%$ higher than the U.S. The difference could be explained because food preparation workers in the eight-county region may also be preparing and cooking food in addition to general food preparation duties.

| Table 25: Compensation Comparison by Area (Regional, State, U.S.) |  |  |  |  |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Area <br> Total Area <br> Employment | Median (50\%) <br> Hourly Wage | Mean (average) <br> Hourly Wage |  |  |
| 8-County | 186.5 | $\$ 11.49$ | $\$ 11.63$ |  |
| Statewide | 24,240 | $\$ 9.28$ | $\$ 10.22$ |  |
| U.S. | 785,370 | $\$ 9.28$ | $\$ 10.05$ |  |

All but three of the 22 respondents who employ Food Preparation Workers require a high school diploma, but no further education requirements are indicated, as shown in Chart 18.

Two do not require a high school diploma, and one requires completion of a technical or Associate's degree. Two indicate that a ServSafe certification is required.

## Chart 18: Food Preparation Worker Educational Requirements


-LHS (less than high school)
-HS (High school)
$\square A D$ (Associate's degree)

## Human Resource Assistant Position

Human resource assistants compile and keep personnel records. In a couple cases, respondents may also expand and elevate the position duties, which could explain a higher than state average hourly wages (by nine percent) and educational requirements. This position is employed by close to half ( $44 \%$ ) or 14 of the respondent organizations. See Tables 26 and 27 for mean, median and comparison hourly wage data.

| Table 26: Food Preparation Worker Compensation |  |  |
| :--- | :---: | :---: |
| Position Level | Mean Hourly <br> Wage | Median Hourly <br> Wage |
| Entry Level | $\$ 15.29$ | $\$ 14.00$ |
| Average Current | $\$ 19.63$ | $\$ 19.38$ |
| Maximum | $\$ 23.34$ | $\$ 22.07$ |


| Table 27: Compensation Comparison by Area (Regional, State, U.S.) |  |  |  |  |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Area <br> Employment |  | Median (50\%) <br> Hourly Wage | Mean (average) <br> Hourly Wage |  |
| 8-County | 14 | $\$ 19.38$ | $\$ 19.63$ |  |
| Statewide | 4,680 | $\$ 17.78$ | $\$ 18.02$ |  |
| U.S. | 139,200 | $\$ 18.03$ | $\$ 18.43$ |  |

Almost 70 percent of the respondents require human resource assistant's to have at least a high school diploma, while over 15 percent require completion of either an Associate's degree or technical program. Two of the respondents (shown as 7.7 percent in Chart 19) require a Bachelor's or Master's degree. These two respondents are most likely employing the position to also act in a higher capacity to handle other personnel and hiring duties. Finally, none of the respondent organizations indicate a need for a license or certification.

## Chart 19: Human Resource Assistant Educational Requirements



- HS (High school)
-AD (Associate's degree)
■BA/BS (Bachelor's degree)
■MA/MS (Master's degree)


## Receptionist Position

The receptionist position is employed by 75 percent of the organizations in the 8-County region. The position commonly provides information to the public, answers phones and inquiries and greets customers and visitors. There are currently a total of 89 receptionist positions included in this wage sample. As is shown in Tables 26, average wage ranges are from $\$ 10.73$ per hour to $\$ 15.70$ maximum. Median rates do not deviate much from the mean, ranging from $\$ 10.57$ to $\$ 15.24$ at maximum.

Table 28: Receptionist Compensation

| Position Level | Mean Hourly <br> Wage | Median Hourly <br> Wage |
| :--- | :---: | :---: |
| Entry Level | $\$ 10.73$ | $\$ 10.57$ |
| Average Current | $\$ 13.88$ | $\$ 13.54$ |
| Maximum | $\$ 15.70$ | $\$ 15.24$ |

Table 28 is a comparison of the mean and median hourly wages for the 8 -County region, Ohio and the U.S. for the receptionist position. The average mean for the 8 -County region is
about 115 percent of the Ohio average, or 15 percent higher, but closer in line with the U.S. average at just 6 percent higher. The difference in wages for this position and possibly for other like positions that require only a high school diploma could be longevity of employees. The 8-County region, among other rural regions in Ohio, boast higher employee retention rates than many other regions and/or metropolitan areas. Longevity is a key contributing factor to higher wages.

| Table 29: Compensation Comparison by Area (Regional, State, U.S.) |  |  |  |  |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Area | Total Area <br> Employment | Median (50\%) <br> Hourly Wage | Mean (average) <br> Hourly Wage |  |
| 8-County | 89 | $\$ 13.54$ | $\$ 13.88$ |  |
| Statewide | 25,480 | $\$ 11.59$ | $\$ 12.11$ |  |
| U.S. | 966,150 | $\$ 12.49$ | $\$ 13.00$ |  |

All but one of the respondent employers requires only a high school diploma for the receptionist position. One requires a technical or Associates degree. None of the respondents require certifications or licenses.

## Administrative Assistant Position

Two-thirds of the respondents are employing administrative assistants, with a total of 45 employed within the 8-County region. Duties for this position can vary from basic clerical and secretarial functions to higher level administrative work involving research, handling information requests, and perhaps some training. Supervision of lower-level clerical staff can also be a position responsibility.

According to Table 30, the mean hourly wage at start for this position is close to $\$ 16$ and caps at over $\$ 22$. The range from entry to maximum is about $\$ 6.60$ per hour. The midlevel average current wage is actually a little less than the starting mean at $\$ 15.63$.

| Table 30: Administrative Assistant Compensation |  |  |  |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Position Level | Mean Hourly <br> Wage | Median Hourly <br> Wage |  |
| Entry Level | $\$ 15.78$ | $\$ 11.93$ |  |
| Average Current | $\$ 19.36$ | $\$ 15.63$ |  |
| Maximum | $\$ 22.39$ | $\$ 18.30$ |  |

For a comparison of hourly wage rates for the administrative assistant position, see Table 31 below. Although the median (mid-point) wage is not as comparable, the mean for the 8County region is commensurate (within 12-15 percentage points) with hourly wages for the same position in Ohio and the U.S.

Table 31: Compensation Comparison by Area (Regional, State, U.S.)

| Area | Total Area <br> Employment | Median (50\%) <br> Hourly Wage | Mean (average) <br> Hourly Wage |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 8-County | 45 | $\$ 15.63$ | $\$ 19.36$ |
| Statewide | 29,200 | $\$ 20.92$ | $\$ 21.82$ |
| U.S. | 803,040 | $\$ 22.84$ | $\$ 24.14$ |

Despite the fact that one of the respondents' requires a certificate or license (not specified), and Master's degree, the rest of the respondents require only a high school diploma and no professional credentials.

## Weatherization Inspector or General Construction Position

Nine respondents employ a weatherization inspector or general construction worker position. This position handles weatherization inspections and general repairs or renovations for buildings and homes typically used for respondents' client housing needs. A range of hourly wages, from entry level to maximum for an average and at mid-point is provided in Table 32 below.

Table 32: Weatherization Inspector or General Construction Worker Compensation

| Position Level | Mean Hourly <br> Wage | Median Hourly <br> Wage |
| :--- | :---: | :---: |
| Entry Level | $\$ 12.28$ | $\$ 11.88$ |
| Average Current | $\$ 19.43$ | $\$ 19.10$ |
| Maximum | $\$ 25.77$ | $\$ 25.00$ |

Table 33 provides a snapshot of average wages for the eight-county region as related to this position, in comparison to the state and nation. This position is about 16.25 percent and almost 27 percent lower than the state and nation, respectively.

| Table 33: Compensation Comparison by Area (Regional, State, U.S.) |  |  |  |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Area <br> Total Area <br> Employment | Median (50\%) <br> Hourly Wage | Mean (average) <br> Hourly Wage |  |
| 8-County | 21 | $\$ 19.10$ | $\$ 19.43$ |
| Statewide | 3,050 | $\$ 23.34$ | $\$ 23.20$ |
| U.S. | 89,280 | $\$ 25.70$ | $\$ 26.55$ |

100 percent of the respondent organizations require completion of high school but no further formal education. Half of the respondents (four of eight that responded to this question) require an Inspector certification, which is also required by the State of Ohio for weatherization inspection work.

## Bus or Van Driver Position

This position transports students or special clients, such as the elderly or persons with disabilities. They ensure safety rules and may assist passengers in boarding or exiting (OES, May 2012). Of the 32 respondents, 21 or 66 percent employ bus or van drivers. Average hourly wage levels depicted in Table 34 range from $\$ 10.47$ starting wage to $\$ 16.18$ at maturity. As far as median wage ranges, entry level mid-point begins at $\$ 10.48$ up to $\$ 16.27$ (similar to the mean). There are 307 Bus Drivers employed with 21 organizations.

| Table 34: Bus or Van Driver Compensation |  |  |  |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Position Level | Mean Hourly <br> Wage | Median Hourly <br> Wage |  |
| Entry Level | $\$ 10.47$ | $\$ 10.48$ |  |
| Average Current | $\$ 12.72$ | $\$ 14.50$ |  |
| Maximum | $\$ 16.18$ | $\$ 16.27$ |  |

A comparison is provided in Table 35, which presents a mean hourly wage that is 94 percent of the Ohio hourly wage. This demonstrates an equitable comparison, although at mid-point (median), the wage exceeds the state level at 114 percent.

| Table 35: Compensation Comparison by Area (Regional, State, U.S.) |  |  |  |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Area <br> Total Area <br> Employment | Median (50\%) <br> Hourly Wage | Mean (average) <br> Hourly Wage |  |
| 8-County | 307 | $\$ 14.50$ | $\$ 12.72$ |
| Statewide | 12,930 | $\$ 12.72$ | $\$ 13.50$ |
| U.S. | 489,750 | $\$ 13.50$ | $\$ 14.01$ |

Just two of the respondents require more than a high school diploma for this position and, of those two, both require a technical degree that provides Commercial Driver License (CDL) training. All the respondents agree that the CDL license is a requirement for this position. No other licenses or certifications are required.

## Delivery Driver Position

Only five (16\%) off the respondent organizations employ a delivery driver. The responsibilities of this position are primarily to pick up or deliver packages. In Table 36 below, average hourly wage levels range from $\$ 8.04$ to $\$ 12.95$ and median wage levels range from $\$ 8.36$ to $\$ 12.27$ hourly.

| Table 36: Delivery Driver Compensation |  |  |  |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Position Level | Mean Hourly <br> Wage | Median Hourly <br> Wage |  |
| Entry Level | $\$ 8.04$ | $\$ 8.36$ |  |
| Average Current | $\$ 8.77$ | $\$ 9.30$ |  |
| Maximum | $\$ 12.95$ | $\$ 12.27$ |  |

Table 37 shows a comparison between the eight-county average wage level and both Ohio and the U.S. The eight-county mean level is only 56.5 percent of the Ohio wage level. An explanation for the disparity in wages may, again, be due to private sector influences, particularly with employers such as the United Parcel Service or other employers concentrated in delivery services who tend to pay a premium for these jobs. Besides a high school diploma, no other qualifications are indicated for this position.

| Table 37: Compensation Comparison by Area (Regional, State, U.S.) |  |  |  |  |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Area |  | Total Area <br> Employment | Median (50\%) <br> Hourly Wage |  |
| 8-County | 30 | $\$ 9.30$ | Mean (average) <br> Hourly Wage |  |
| Statewide | 28,540 | $\$ 13.36$ | $\$ 8.77$ |  |
| U.S. | 769,010 | $\$ 14.13$ | $\$ 15.52$ |  |

## Final Thoughts

The researchers were pleased with the $50 \%$ response rate, adding validity to the findings.
The data from this survey shows that wage rates tend to be lower for most of the surveyed positions than the wages for both the state and national averages - especially among the top administrative positions. This disparity may be a result of private sector influence.

Although survey results show that wage rates for most of the identified positions are lower than state averages for similar positions, employers' opinions of the workforce appear to be very positive.

## Ohio Not Seasonally Adjusted Unemployment Rates March 2013



Ohio Department of Job and Family Services

Michael B. Colbert, Director

## Map Outlining the Ohio Counties Surveyed



## 8-County Compensation Survey

## Organizational Information

Depending on the size of your staff, this survey should take approximately 20 to 40 minutes. Organization or individual specific data will be kept strictly confidential.
Is your organization public or private?PublicPrivate

Please check the primary community services provided by your organization (Check all that apply):
Omergency Services
$\bigcirc$ Education
O Health Care
O
Food and NutritionFamily DevelopmentTraining/Employment Income ManagementHousingEconomic Development

## General Workforce Information

How many employees currently work for your organization?


How many volunteers currently work for your organization? $\square$
Please rate the regional workforce

Quality

Quantity

Availability

Stability

| Excellent | Good | Average | Poor | Very Poor |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| $\square$ | $\square$ | $\square$ | $\square$ | $\square$ |
| $\square$ | $\square$ | $\square$ | $\square$ | $\square$ |

## Insurance Benefits

For insurance benefits, please indicate (if applicable) total annual cost per empreyee and employer percentage share of coverage.

Total annual cost (i.e. $\$ 12,000$ )
Health insurance
Health insurance (part-time employees)

Health insurance (family/dependents)
Dental insurance

Dental insurance (part-time employees)
Dental insurance (family/dependents)
Vision


Employer percentage costshare (i.e. 80\%)
Health insurance

Health insurance (part-time employees)


Health insurance (family/dependents)
Dental insurance

Dental insurance (part-time employees)
Dental insurance (family/dependents)
Vision
Vision (part-time employees)
Vision (family/dependents)
Group life insurance
Long term disability insurance
Short term disability insurance
Long term care insurance

## Paid Time Off and Other Benefits

Time-Off Benefits


Other (please specify) $\square$

Other Benefits


## Compensation and Job Requirements

The following questions concern occupational wage data and requirements for atrety of job categories. Please provide information only for job categories with position descripticis trat match employees within your organization.
*Does your organization have an Executive Director? (Chief Executive responsible froverall direction of agency operation

BA/BS (Bachelor's degree)MA/MS (Master's degree)

〇 PhD or Professional License or Certification requirements?

YesNo
If yes, please describe:

*Does your organization have a Finance Manager? (Administrative position responsible for fiscal and budgetary functions)No
Finance Manager compensation (please enter all salary data as an hourly wage, ie. $\$ 22.50 \mathrm{n}$ n.
Entry Level


Maximum wage

Educational requirements?


LHS (less than high school)


HS (High School)
VS (Vocational School)


AD (Associate degree)BA/BS (Bachelor's degree)MA/MS (Master's degree)PhD or Professicnaı

icense or Certification requirements?Yes


No
If yes, please describe: $\square$
*Does your organization have Program Director positions, for example, Social Services Director? (Administrative position responsible for planning, directing and managing the operations of programs or activities. Work includes formulating pelicres, managing daily activities and overseeing staff)
$\bigcirc_{Y e}$
$\bigcirc$
No

How many employees do you have in this job category?
Program Director compensation (please enter all salary data as an hourly wage, i.e. $\$ 22.50$

$\mathrm{p} / \mathrm{hr}$ )

Entry level wage


Average current wage

Maximum wage


Program Manager positions, for example, Health Services Manager? (Administrative position responsible for planning, directing and organizing programs or activities. Work may involve preparing budgets or directing others.)

O Yes
O №
How many employees do you have in this job category?

Program Manager compensation (please enter all salary data as an hourly wage, ie. $\$ 22.50 \mathrm{p} / \mathrm{hr}$.)

Entry level wage

Average current wage
$\square$


Maximum wage


Educational requirements?LHS (less than high school)HS (High School)VS (Vocational School)

$\bigcirc \mathrm{AD}$ (Associate degree)
BA/BS (Bachelor's degree)


OMA/MS (Master's degree)
O PhD or Professional License or Certification requirements?

$\bigcirc$ No
If yes, please describe:
*Does your organization have Accốțant positions? (Employee who performs numerous fiscal duties as delegated by a Director)
$\bigcirc_{\mathrm{Yes}}$
$\bigcirc$ No


How many employees do you have in this job category? $\square$

Accountant compensation (please enter all salary data as an hourly wage, i.e. $\$ 22.50 \mathrm{p} / \mathrm{hr}$.)

Entry level wage $\square$

Average current wage


## Maximum wage



Educational requirements?LHS (less than high school)
O
HS (High School)
〇VS (Vocational School)
O
AD (Associate degree)BA/BS (Bachelor's degree)MA/MS (Master's degree)
O
PhD or Professional

License or Certification requirements?
$\bigcirc \mathrm{Yes}$
$\bigcirc \mathrm{No}$
If yes, please describe:

*Does your organization have Social Worker position? (Employee who provides social services to qualified persons under direction of Director or

Manager)

$\square$

## Average current wage

$\square$

Maximum wage $\square$

Educational requirements?
LHS (less than high school)HS (High School)
$\bigcirc$ VS (Vocational School)
O
AD (Associate degree)
BA/BS (Bachelor's degree)
O MA/MS (Master's degree)
$\bigcirc \mathrm{PhD}$ or Professional
License or Certification requirements?
$\bigcirc \mathrm{Yes}$
$\bigcirc \mathrm{No}$
If yes, please describe:

*Does your organization have Preschool Teacher/Specialedwalion Teacher positions? (Employee provides educational services to children, including children with special neea, under direction of manager or director)


How many employees do you have in this job category?


Preschool/Special Education Teacher compensation (please enter all salary data as an hourly wage, ie. $\$ 22.50 \mathrm{p} / \mathrm{hr}$.)


Educational requirements?

O LHS (less than high school)HS (High School)
○ vs (Vocational School)AD (Associate degree)
○ BA/BS (Bachelor's degree)
〇 MA/MS (Master's degree)
〇 PhD or Professional
License or Certification requirements?
$\bigcirc_{\text {Yes }}$
○ No

If yes, please describe:

*Does your organization have Teacher Assistant positions? (Employee performs instructional duties and delivers direct
AD (Associate degree)
BA/BS (Bachelor's degree)
O MA/MS (Master's degree)
O PhD or Professional

License or Certification requirements?
$\bigcirc$ Yes
$\bigcirc \mathrm{No}$
If yes, please describe:

*Does your organization have Registered Nursing positions? (Employee develops and implehont ts nursing or health care plans, assesses client health needs, maintains medical records and/or administers nursing(Care)

Yes



No
How many employees do you have in this job category?


Registered Nurse compensation (please enter all salary data as an hour wage, i.e. $\$ 22.50 \mathrm{p} / \mathrm{hr}$.)


MA/MS (Master's degree)
O PhD or Professional

License or Certification requirements?
$\bigcirc$ Yes
O №
If yes, please describe:

*Does your organization have Food Preparation Worker positions? (Employee performs a variety of
food preparation and cooking duties)


Yes

○ no

How many employees do you have in this job category?


Food Preparation Worker compensation (please enter all salary data as an hourly wage, ie.
$\$ 22.50 \mathrm{p} / \mathrm{hr}$.)

Entry level wage

Average current wage


Maximum wage
Educational requirements?


LHS (less than high school)
O HS (High School)


License or Certification requirements?
$\bigcirc$ Yes
○
If yes, please describe:

*Does your organization have Human Resource Coordinator/Assistant positions? (Employee maintains persomnel records, prepares reports and furnishes employee information)


If yes, please describe:
*Does your organization have Receptionist positions? (Employee answers inquiries and provides information to the public and other interested parties)
$\bigcirc$ Yes
$\bigcirc \mathrm{No}$

How many employees do you have in this job category?

Receptionist compensation (please enter all salary data as an hourly wage, i.e. $\$ 22.50 \mathrm{p} / \mathrm{hr}$.)

Entry level wage

Average current wage

Maximum wage

Educational requirements?

*Does your organization have Administrative Assistant positions? (Employee provides administrative support by preparing reports, handling information requests and performing clerical functions)Yes
$\bigcirc \mathrm{No}$
How many employees do you have in this job category?

Administrative Assistant compensation (please enter all salary data as an hourly wage, i.e. $\$ 22.50 \mathrm{p} / \mathrm{hr}$.)


LHS (less than high school)
HS (High School)
O VS (Vocational School)


8-County Compensation Study

How many employees do you have in this job category? $\square$

Weatherization Inspector or general Construction Trade compensation (please enter all salary data as an hourly wage, ie. $\$ 22.50 \mathrm{p} / \mathrm{hr}$.)

Entry level wage

Average current wage


Maximum wage


Educational requirements?
LHS (less than high school)
OHS (High School)
$\bigcirc$ VS (Vocational School)
○ AD (Associate degree)
BA/BS (Bachelor's degree)
O MA/MS (Master's degree)
〇 PhD or Professional
License or Certification requirements?
$\bigcirc_{\mathrm{Yes}}$
$\bigcirc \mathrm{No}$
If yes, please describe:

*Does your organization have Bus or Van Bitiver positions? (Employee transports clients and may assist passengers in boarding or exiting)

$\bigcirc$ Yes


How many employees dolor have in this job category?


Bus or Van Driven compensation (please enter all salary data as an hourly wage, ie. \$22.50
 phr.)

Entry level wage

Average current wage $\square$

Maximum wage


Educational requirements?

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \text { LHS (less than high school) } \\
& \text { HS (High School) } \\
& \text { VS (Vocational School) } \\
& \text { AD (Associate degree) } \\
& \text { BA/BS (Bachelor's degree) } \\
& \text { MA/MS (Master's degree) } \\
& \text { PhD or Professional }
\end{aligned}
$$



License or Certification requirements?

$\bigcirc \mathrm{No}_{0}$
If yes, please describe:

*Does your organization have Delivery Driver positions? (Employee drives a light vehicle to deliver or pick up meals or merchandise)


Educational requirements?

O LHS (less than high school)

O HS (High School)
○ vs (Vocational School)AD (Associate degree)BA/BS (Bachelor's degree)MA/MS (Master's degree)
PhD or Professional
License or Certification requirements?
$\bigcirc$ Yes
○ No


If yes, please describe:


Please provide contact information for copy of final report.
Name:


City/Town:

State:


Zip:

Country:
Email Address:


Thank You!

